**Audit and Standards Committee** Report To:

Date: 18 March 2019

**Report Title:** Interim Report on the Council's Systems of Internal Control

2018/19

Report of: David Heath, Head of Audit and Counter Fraud

Ward(s) Affected: ΑII

Purpose of report: To inform Councillors on the adequacy and effectiveness

> of the Council's systems of internal control during the first eleven months of 2018/19, and to summarise the

work on which this opinion is based.

Officer To note that the overall standards of internal control were recommendation(s):

generally satisfactory during the first eleven months of

2018/19 (as shown in Section 2).

Reasons for The remit of the Audit and Standards Committee includes recommendations:

the duties to agree an Annual Audit Plan and keep it under

review, and to keep under review the probity and effectiveness of internal controls, both financial and operational, including the Council's arrangements for

identifying and managing risk.

Name: David Heath Contact Officer(s)

> Post title: Head of Audit and Counter Fraud E mail: David.Heath@lewes-eastbourne.gov.uk

**Telephone number: 01273 085157** 

#### 1 Introduction

- The Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy (CIPFA) has, with the other governing bodies that set auditing standards for the various parts of the public sector, adopted a common set of Public Sector Internal Audit Standards (PSIAS) that were first applied from 1 April 2013. The PSIAS were updated in March 2017. The updated standards are not materially different from the previous version, and so have not been separately reported to the Committee.
- The PSIAS 2017 continue to specify the requirements for the reporting to the Audit and Standards Committee and senior management by the Head of Audit and Counter Fraud (HACF). These requirements are met via a series of reports, including interim reports to each meeting of the Committee.
- 1.3 Each interim report includes a review of the work undertaken by Internal Audit compared to the annual programme, an opinion of HACF on the internal control, risk management and governance environment at the Council, together with any significant risk exposures and control issues, in the period since the beginning of the financial year. Each interim report contains an appendix that includes an outline of each of the final audit reports issued since the previous meeting of the

Committee, and an appendix that outlines any significant recommendations that have not yet been implemented.

- 1.4 In September 2015, Cabinet approved a strategy for the development of shared services between Lewes District Council (LDC) and Eastbourne Borough Council (EBC) based on the integration of the majority of council services via a Joint Transformation Programme (JTP). The formal integration of the Internal Audit and Counter Fraud Teams in both councils took place on 1 July 2017.
- 1.5 Together with a number of other corporate services, the third and final phase of the JTP process has included Audit and Counter Fraud. The results of the consultation process were confirmed in mid-February 2019, and there are ongoing discussions on the detail of the next steps. These include the departure of the HACF and the creation of a new post of Chief Internal Auditor, the departure of one of the Audit Managers, and the creation of a new Auditor post. Recruitment to the vacant posts is underway.

#### 2 Internal Control Environment at Lewes District Council

2.1 The Annual Report on the Council's Systems of Internal Control for 2017/18 was presented to the July 2018 meeting of the Committee. The report included the opinion of HACF that the overall standards of internal control are generally satisfactory. This opinion was based on the work of Internal Audit, the internal assurance framework, external reviews, and the Council's work on risk management. In the period since the start of the financial year there has been nothing to cause that opinion to change and there have been no instances in which internal control issues created significant risks for Council activities or services.

#### 3 Internal Audit work 2018/19

- 3.1 This section of the report summarises the work undertaken by Internal Audit, compared to the annual plan that was presented to the Audit and Standards Committee in March 2018. Further information on each of the audits completed since the previous meeting of the Committee is given at Appendix A1.
- **3.2** Table 1 shows that a total of 619 audit days have been undertaken compared to 617 days planned in the first eleven months of the year.

Table 1: Plan audit days compared to actual audit days for April 2018 to February 2019

Audit Area	Actual audit days	Plan audit days for	Actual audit days	Pro rata plan audit
	for the year	the year	to date	days to
	2017/18	2018/19		date
Main Systems	347	308	425	
Central Systems	67	65	65	
Departmental Systems	3	87	28	
Performance and Management Scrutiny	34	30	11	
Computer Audit	5	25	12	
Management Responsibilities/Unplanned Audits	101	158	78	
Total	557	673	619	617

Note: The 'Pro rata plan audit days to date' provides a broad guide to the resources required to carry out planned audits. The actual timing of the individual audits will depend on a variety of factors, including the workloads and other commitments in the departments to be audited.

The variance of two days is not material, and it is estimated that the audit days will remain close to plan by the year end.

- 3.3 *Main Systems:* The key work has been on the testing of the major financial systems in order to gain assurance on the adequacy of internal controls for the Annual Governance Statement (AGS) and to inform BDO's work on the Council's accounts for 2017/18. The testing was completed and a final report issued. The results contributed to the overall opinion given by HACF (see Section 2 above). The corresponding work for 2018/19 is underway.
- 3.4 The work on behalf of BDO to test the Council's HB subsidy claim 2016/17 has been the other main priority and is now complete. BDO had identified the need for significant additional testing to address the issues noted in the 2015/16 claim and other errors noted in the current claim. The timetabled date for BDO to sign off and submit the audited claim was the end of November 2017 but, because of the significant extra work required and BDO's other commitments, the claim was submitted in the last week of September 2018.
- 3.5 The corresponding exercise to test the Council's HB subsidy claim 2017/18 is now the main priority and the work has been underway for some months. The results from the initial sample testing have helped to inform BDO's work on the Council's 2017/18 accounts. BDO identified the need for significant additional testing to address the issues noted in the 2016/17 claim. The timetabled date for BDO to sign off and submit the audited claim was the end of November 2018 but, because of the late start to the exercise and the significant extra work required the claim is unlikely to be submitted for some months. Discussions are being held with BDO to determine a likely submission date.
- **3.6 Central Systems:** An audit of Safeguarding at both councils has been completed by audit personnel in Eastbourne, and a final report has been issued. A final report has been issued for the annual audit of Ethics. The review of joint ventures and Council owned companies has been completed and a draft report has been issued.
- 3.7 Departmental Systems: The audit of Estates Management, incorporating work on the corresponding function at EBC, began in 2017 but was put on hold to free resources for the work on the HB subsidy claim and the testing of the main financial systems the audit has been completed by audit personnel in Eastbourne and a final report has been issued. An audit of the Licensing of Houses in Multiple Occupation (HMO) has been carried out by personnel in Eastbourne, and a draft report has been issued. An audit of the other aspects of Licensing is underway.
- **3.8 Performance and Management Scrutiny:** The initial work in this category was the review of the data that supports the Annual Governance Statement (AGS) for 2018, with the main task being the examination of the revised Strategic Risk Register.
- **3.9** Computer Audit: Internal Audit has examined the IT aspects of the main financial systems, and is examining the controls over the implementation of the CX Housing Management system. An audit of Cyber Security is at the planning stage.

- **3.10** *Management Responsibilities/Unplanned Audits:* This category provides resources for activities such as support for the Audit and Standards Committee, managing the Counter Fraud Team, liaison with BDO, managing the Follow Up procedures, as well as for special projects or investigations.
- 3.11 CMT requested Internal Audit to carry out an assurance review to support the establishment of the newly configured Health and Safety (H&S) service. The review includes site visits to two key service areas the Eastbourne Crematorium and the Waste and Recycling (W&R) service for LDC. A final interim report was issued on the W&R aspects of the review, and the results of the H&S review of the crematorium have been included in a draft report that also covers other aspects of the Bereavement Services at the location. Internal Audit has also carried out a review of the management of statutory building compliance at both councils; an interim report was issued in June 2018, with a final report issued during October 2018. HACF is currently engaged in a series of governance and risk management reviews with the Chief Finance Officer.

# 4 Quality Reviews/Customer Satisfaction Surveys/Performance Indicators (PIs)

- **4.1** The results of the Internal Audit quality reviews and customer satisfaction surveys for 2017/18 were reported to the July meeting of the Committee. The results enabled the HACF to report that the Internal Audit service at Lewes achieves its aims, and objectives, and operates in accordance with the Internal Audit Strategy as approved by the Audit and Standards Committee.
- 4.2 The November 2018 meeting of the Committee received HACF's recommendations for a revised set of Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) that will cover the Internal Audit service at both Lewes and Eastbourne. The results of the KPIs will be included in the annual performance report for 2018/19, together with the results from the client questionnaires.

#### 5 Peer Review

- 5.1 The External Peer Review of LDC Internal Audit has been completed. The review was carried out by the Principal Auditor at Chichester District Council and the results were reported to the September 2018 meeting of the Committee. The overall results of the review were that the LDC Internal Audit service generally conforms to the standards set by PSIAS 2017.
- 5.2 The Peer Review examined the service in four key sections Purpose and positioning; Structure and resources; Audit execution; Impacts comparing service activities to the statements of good practice contained within the PSIAS. The review also took account of the results from the client questionnaires sent to CMT, Heads of Service and the Chair of the Audit and Standards Committee.
- 5.3 The review found that the Internal Audit service fully complies with 43% of the statements of good practice and, for the remainder, complies with the PSIAS requirements in all material respects. The exceptions were in areas such as annual appraisals, succession planning, and the rotation and technical development of audit staff who are not professionally qualified. No remedial action is planned because the service complies with Council policies in these areas, but these do not meet PSIAS requirements in all respects.

Where the service is planning remedial action is in completing the audit manual which is in the processing of being re-worked following the merger with Eastbourne Borough Council. The work is underway, and includes the procurement of the Pentana audit management system, but no target date for completion has been set.

# 6 Review of 2018/19 Audit Plan

- 6.1 As part of the report to the March 2018 meeting of the Committee that detailed the Annual Audit Plan, HACF advised that there would be a nine month review of the Audit Plan for 2018/19 to assess whether any significant changes are necessary.
- 6.2 That review has taken place and the results of the review were presented to the January 2019 meeting of the Committee. The review took account of a range of issues including the significant extra work on the HB subsidy claim, the loss of audit days due to sickness, and the extra days worked by HACF. There has been a significant impact on the number of days available to complete the audit programme for 2018/19, and there has been a need to re-assign some tasks.
- 6.3 HACF advised that the significant aspects of the annual audit plan would be covered, but with a small number of audits scheduled into the Annual Plan for 2019/20. Other audits in the programme for 2018/19 that are planned or underway will continue to a normal conclusion. A number of these audits may run on into the early months of 2019/20.

# 7 Combatting Fraud and Corruption

#### **National initiatives**

7.1 The 2018 National Fraud Initiative (NFI) exercise is underway, with the Counter Fraud Investigations Manager in Eastbourne taking the coordination role for both councils. The matches were received in February 2019, with 1654 matches for LDC across 55 reports. Each report sets out different types of potential fraud among benefit claimants, housing tenants, and anyone receiving payments or discounts from the Council. There is a targeted approach to the examination of matches to identify those that indicate the greatest likelihood of fraud or significant error. So far, 333 matches have been closed with no errors or frauds identified. A further 42 matches are currently being examined.

#### Local initiatives

- 7.2 The Investigation Team is a member of the East Sussex Fraud Officers Group (ESFOG), a body that enables information sharing and joint initiatives with neighbouring authorities on a wide range of counter fraud work. Since 2014/15, a sub group of authorities within ESFOG, including LDC and EBC, have been working as a 'Hub' to coordinate new counter fraud initiatives across East Sussex.
- 7.3 The Hub has been administered by officers at Eastbourne, with input from ESFOG partners as appropriate. Lewes and Eastbourne Counter Fraud activities have benefitted from Hub funding in the provision of training, the introduction of a shared case management system, a shared approach to publicity for Hub activities, and the set-up of an on-line system to allow the public to report suspected frauds.

7.4 Hub partners have agreed to wind down Hub activities and for it to no longer exist as a formal entity. Hub funds have been set aside to cover known future commitments, with the balance divided among members to fund local Counter Fraud initiatives. Counter Fraud staff in the member authorities continue to share information and liaise on individual cases.

# **Counter Fraud Team**

- 7.5 At present, countering housing tenancy fraud and abandonment, and preventing RTB fraud, are the main operational priorities for the Counter Fraud Team at Lewes because of the evidence of this being a high risk area for the Council. There are 22 cases of suspected abandonment and/or subletting under investigation, plus two of suspected housing application fraud. Six properties have been returned to stock after joint action by officers in Housing, Legal Services and Counter Fraud to address cases of abandonment or anti-social behaviour. Further property returns are anticipated in current cases where evidence gives a strong indication that the tenant no longer lives at the property. One case of abandonment has been referred to Legal Services for preparation for court action.
- 7.6 Since April 2018, 29 new RTB applications have been received for checking to prevent fraud and protect the Council against money laundering. In the same period, 22 RTB applications have been approved and passed for processing, and eight applications are currently under review. In the same period, seven RTB applications have been withdrawn or closed after intervention by the team. The team will assess these applications to determine whether the cases indicate potential fraud. Two cases of suspected RTB fraud are under investigation, and one of these cases has been referred to Legal Services for preparation for court action.
- 7.7 Audit and Counter Fraud has in place an agreement with DWP for the management of cases of HB fraud. The major work on each HB case is the responsibility of the national Single Fraud Investigation Service (SFIS) within DWP. LDC retains a role in referring cases of suspected HB fraud to SFIS and handling requests for information. A member of that Eastbourne Counter Fraud team and a member of the HB team share the DWP liaison work for LDC, and this arrangement allows the Lewes Counter Fraud team to focus on case work in other areas. In the period since April 2018, there have been 15 referrals to SFIS, and 33 information requests have been actioned.

# 8 Risk Management

- **8.1** Cabinet approved the Risk Management Strategy in September 2003. Since then risk management at the Council has been developed via a series of action plans, with the result that all the elements of the risk management framework set out in the strategy are in place and are maintained at best practice standards.
- 8.2 The Annual Report on Risk Management and the Strategic Risk Register was presented to the March 2018 meeting of the Committee. The report recommended a change to the circulation of the report, with the Committee becoming the principal recipient of the Strategic Risk Register. The risk management process has identified that most risks are mitigated by the effective operation of controls or other measures. However, there are some risks that are beyond the Council's control, for

example a major incident, a 'flu' pandemic, a downturn in the national economy or a major change in government policy or legislation. The Council has sound planning and response measures to mitigate the effects of such events, and continues to monitor risks and the effectiveness of controls. The overall satisfactory situation for risk management has helped to inform the opinion on the internal control environment.

- **8.3** CMT has reviewed the Strategic Risk Register, and the results of the review were reported to the September 2018 meeting of the Committee.
- 8.4 The December 2018 Cabinet meeting received the draft budget proposals for 2019/20. In summary, the wider economic picture remains challenging and there is no end in sight to austerity for local government. The budget report contained a detailed risk analysis that highlighted a range of financial risks, potential outcomes and possible mitigations in areas such pay and price inflation, and changes in government legislation. The risks assessed as having a 'High' likelihood and the most significant impact were probable increases in interest rates and their effect on borrowing costs, and the government reductions to retained business rates.
- 8.5 The February 2019 Cabinet meeting received updated reports on the Council's financial performance and, following wide consultation on the draft budget, the formal budget proposals for 2019/20. The budget report included the conclusion that 'The Council is reasonably placed financially to meet the demands on its services as well as the reductions in Government support. However, the challenge over the medium term is profound and more change is necessary to move to a sustainable position. The Council is more dependent on commercial activity than it has ever been and this requires a high level of monitoring and risk management.'

# 8.6 System of management assurance

**8.7** The Council operates a management assurance system, which enabled senior officers to confirm the proper operation of internal controls, including compliance with the Constitution, in those services for which they are responsible. As part of this process senior managers are required to consider whether there were any significant governance issues during 2017/18. None were reported and, at its meeting on 26 June 2018, CMT confirmed that there were no significant governance issues to report.

# 9 Corporate governance

9.1 The Council is required to produce an Annual Governance Statement (AGS), which outlines the main elements of the Council's governance arrangements and the results of the annual review of the governance framework including the system of internal control. The AGS for 2018 was presented to the July 2018 meeting of the Audit and Standards Committee.

#### 10 External assurance

10.1 The Government relies on external auditors to periodically review the work of the Council to make sure it is meeting its statutory obligations and performing well in its services. The Council's current external auditors are BDO, and the results of their external reviews have helped inform the opinion on the internal control environment.

- 10.2 Audit Completion Report (September 2018) This report summarised the key issues from work carried out by BDO during the year ended 31 March 2018. When the report was published it represented an interim position because BDO were in the process of completing the audit the Council had not prepared the draft and final Statement of Accounts in accordance with the new statutory deadlines. The interim key issues highlighted in the report overview section were:
  - BDO had not identified any significant audit risks since the presentation of their Audit Plan in February 2018, and there were no significant changes to the planned audit approach.
  - BDO had not identified any material misstatements, although the audit was still in progress and could result in audit differences.
  - BDO were satisfied that, despite the recognised funding gap in the Medium Term Financial Strategy (MTFS), the Council has appropriate arrangements to remain financially sustainable over the period of the MTFS. All the required savings for 2018/19 had been identified.
  - BDO anticipated issuing an unmodified opinion on the arrangements to secure economy, efficiency and effectiveness in the use of resources.
  - Subject to successful completion of outstanding work, BDO anticipated issuing an unmodified opinion on the Council's financial statements, and on the consistency of other information in the Statement of Accounts with the financial statements.
- **10.3** Grant Claims and Returns Certification for year ended 31 March 2017 (November 2018). The key points were:
  - The audit of the HB subsidy claim identified a high level of errors within the
    cases tested. This situation, together with the prior year issues identified in the
    previous audit, required a significant amount of extra testing comprising ten
    samples of 40 cases, and 100% testing of 129 non-HRA cases.
  - The additional work required to be completed by BDO and the Council meant that the audit was completed and a qualified certification issued on 28 September 2018, significantly later than the national deadline of 30 November 2017.
  - The claim was valued at £35,127k. The audit identified the need for five different types of amendments to the claim totalling £49k. Because the total level of errors was below the allowed threshold, this did not result in further changes to the total amount of subsidy claimed. A final adjustment of the claim resulted in an increase of £678.
  - The review of the returns for the Pooling of Housing Capital Receipts was completed satisfactorily without amendment or qualification. Total receipts were recorded as £1,964k, of which £408k was payable to DCLG.

# 10.4 Future external audit arrangements

- 10.5 Under the provisions of the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014, the Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government has specified that a company, Public Sector Audit Appointments (PSAA) Limited, will appoint auditors to local government, police and some NHS bodies.
- 10.6 The Council has opted into the PSAA arrangements, and was consulted on the appointment of the external auditor for the period of five years from 2018/19. PSAA have appointed Deloitte LLP, and the Council responded to the consultation to confirm its acceptance of the appointment, which started on 1 April 2018. Deloitte LLP will also be the external auditors for EBC. Initial contacts have been made with representatives of Deloitte LLP to establish the relationship and begin the audit planning process.
- 10.7 BDO is carrying out the audit of the 2017/18 HB subsidy claim, and will therefore be working with the Council for some months into 2019. HACF obtained cost quotations from Deloitte LLP for the independent check and sign off of the HB subsidy claim exercises after the BDO contract has ceased. Deloitte LLP has been appointed to this role for the 2018/19 HB subsidy claim.

# 11 Financial Appraisal

**11.1** There are no financial implications arising from the recommendations in this report other than those already contained within existing budgets.

# 12 Legal Implications

**12.1** There are no direct legal implications arising from this report.

# 13 Risk Management Implications

13.1 If the Council does not have an effective risk management framework that is subject to proper oversight by Councillors it will not be able to demonstrate that it has in place adequate means to safeguard Council assets and services, and it could be subject to criticism from the Council's external auditor or the public.

# 14 Equality analysis

**14.1** An equalities impact assessment is not considered necessary because the report is for information only and involves no key decisions.

# 15 Background Papers

Report to the Audit and Standards Committee – Annual Audit Plan 2018/19, 19 March 2018

2018/19 Annual Audit Plan

# 16 Appendices

**16.1** There is no Statement of Internal Audit work and key issues (normally Appendix A1).

- **16.2** Appendix A2 Table of abbreviations.
- **16.3** There is no Log of Significant Outstanding Recommendations (normally Appendix B) for this report.

#### **APPENDIX A2**

#### Table of abbreviations

AGS - Annual Governance Statement

BDO – BDO, the Council's external auditors. Formerly BDO Stoy Hayward

CIPFA – Chartered institute of Public Finance and Accounting

CMT – Corporate Management Team

CTRS - Council Tax Reduction Scheme

DCLG - Department for Communities and Local Government

DWP – Department of Work and Pensions

EBC - Eastbourne Borough Council

ESFOG - East Sussex Fraud Officers Group

ESPB - East Sussex Prevent Board

GDPR - General Data Protection Regulation

HACF - Head of Audit and Counter Fraud

HB - Housing Benefit

HRA – Housing Revenue Account. Refers to Council owned housing

HSO - Health and Safety Officer

ISO – International Organisation for Standardisation

IT - Information Technology

JTP - Joint Transformation Project

LATC – Local Authority Trading Company

LDC - Lewes District Council

LLP - Limited Liability Partnership

NDR - Non Domestic Rates

NFI - National Fraud Initiative

PFSS - Property and Facilities Shared Service

Pls – Performance Indicators

PSIAS – Public Sector Internal Audit Standards

PSAA - Public Sector Audit Appointments

QAIP – Quality Assurance and Improvement Programme

RTB – Right to Buy

SFIS - Single Fraud Investigation Service

SPB - Strategic Property Boards

WGA – Whole of Government Accounts

W&R – Waste and Recycling